



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/622,299	07/18/2003	Arvind N. Shah	CR44U-US	7273
60723	7590	02/23/2009	EXAMINER	
AVON PRODUCTS, INC.			KANTAMNENI, SHOBHA	
AVON PLACE			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
SUFFERN, NY 10901			1617	
			NOTIFICATION DATE	DELIVERY MODE
			02/23/2009	ELECTRONIC

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Notice of the Office communication was sent electronically on above-indicated "Notification Date" to the following e-mail address(es):

PATENT.DEPARTMENT@AVON.COM

Office Action Summary	Application No. 10/622,299	Applicant(s) SHAH ET AL.	
	Examiner Shobha Kantamneni	Art Unit 1617	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 02/20/2009.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1,5-14 and 21-29 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☒ Claim(s) NONE is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1,5-14,21-29 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413) |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ |
| 3) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application |
| Paper No(s)/Mail Date <u>10/06/2008</u> | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____ |

DETAILED ACTION

Continued Examination Under 37 CFR 1.114

A request for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, including the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e), was filed in this application after final rejection. Since this application is eligible for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, and the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e) has been timely paid, the finality of the previous Office action has been withdrawn pursuant to 37 CFR 1.114. Applicant's submission filed on 02/02/2009 has been entered.

Claims 1, 5-14, and 21-29 are pending, and examined herein.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 1, 5-10, 13, 14, 21-26, 29 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Tan et al. (US 6,511,672, PTO-892 of record), in view of Chapman et al. (US 3,647,492, PTO-892).

Tan et al. disclose cosmetic composition for topical application to skin comprising a first platelet of alumina treated with metal oxide such as iron-oxide, a second platelet for example mica, bismuth oxychloride, alumina, copper, bronze, silver or silica treated

Art Unit: 1617

with a spherical scattering component. It is also taught that iron oxides as pigments match the color of the skin See abstract; column 1, lines 19-21; col. 3, line 30-col. 4, line 22. It is disclosed that the two platelets together which include first platelet and second platelet form the mosaic which gently reflects light and matches the natural color of the skin. See column 3, lines 31-36. It is further taught that the composition comprising first platelet, and second platelet, which together match the natural color of the skin further comprises non-interference pigment. See column 9, claims 8-9. It is taught that the non-interference pigments provide color to match the color of the skin tone i.e the non-interference pigment component also matches the natural skin tone. See column 6, lines 22-26. The method of preparing the cosmetic composition by blending the platelets and pigments is also disclosed. See col. 8, claims 1-3. It is further disclosed that the combination of platelets and pigments creates a mosaic of color and optically manipulates light such that the lines, wrinkles, disfigurations and discolorations on the skin appear to substantially vanish and the net effect is the skin appears natural, luminous and flawless. See abstract; column 4, lines 20-21; column 6, lines 15-49; column 8, claims 1,3. Inorganic pigments, and organic pigments are used in the composition. The second platelet comprising bismuth oxychloride is present in an amount of 0.1 to 10.0 %, and the pigments are present in an amount of 0.05 to 50 % by weight. See column 4, lines 33-35; column 5, lines 12-15. The makeup products include foundations, blushes, pressed or loose powders, concealers, bronzers, lipsticks, lipglosses. Also the products can be in the form of gels, sticks, water-in oil emulsions, sprays, pressed or loose powders. See column 6, lines 59-66. For liquid foundation a

Art Unit: 1617

water-in-oil emulsion is preferred, and the oil component comprises a silicone oil. See column 7, lines 4-9; column 8, EXAMPLE 1.

Tan et al. do not explicitly teach bismuth oxychloride bonded to a colorant with calcium stearate.

Chapman et al. discloses cosmetic product which comprises bismuth oxychloride to which particles of the finely divided pigment are intimately bound by means of a binder such as calcium stearate. It is taught that simple mixtures of bismuth oxychloride with the color pigment but without the binder present generally fail to exhibit the pearlescent qualities of the unpigmented substrate. See abstract; column 2, lines 10-17.

It would have been obvious to a person of ordinary skill in the art at the time of invention to employ bismuth oxychloride bonded to a colorant with calcium stearate because 1) Tan teaches that the second platelet can be mica, bismuth oxychloride, alumina, copper or bronze etc., and 2) Chapman teaches that simple mixtures of bismuth oxychloride with the color pigment but without the binder present generally fail to exhibit the pearlescent qualities of the unpigmented substrate. Accordingly, one of ordinary skill in the art would have been motivated to employ bismuth oxychloride bonded to a colorant with calcium stearate i.e first platelet a colorant of Tan is bonded to bismuth oxychloride with calcium stearate with reasonable expectation of success of obtaining a composition that possess pearlescent qualities of bismuth oxychloride, and with reasonable expectation of success of obtaining a composition which matches the natural color of the skin on bonding bismuth oxychloride with the first platelet a colorant as taught by Tan et al.

Art Unit: 1617

Furthermore, as the teachings of Tan et al., and Chapman et al. renders the claimed composition obvious, the property of such a claimed composition will also be rendered obvious by the prior art teachings, since the properties, namely the pearlescent component matches in shade a natural skin tone, are inseparable from its composition. Therefore, if the prior art teaches the composition or renders the composition obvious, then the properties are also taught or rendered obvious by the prior art. In re Spada, 911 F.2d 705, 709, 15 USPQ 1655, 1658 (Fed. Cir. 1990.) See MPEP 2112.01.

Response to Arguments

Applicant argues that “even assuming.....that one skilled in the art would have been motivated to incorporate Chapman’s “bismuth oxychloride to which particles of the finely divided pigment are intimately bound by means of a binder such as calcium stearate” into Tan’s composition as the “second platelet,” one still would not arrive at the claimed invention because (i) Chapman does not teach, or suggest a pearlescent component shade-matched to skin tone, and (ii) Tan matches the mixture of the “first platelet’ and second platelet” to skin tone --not the individual platelets.” These arguments have been considered, but not found persuasive. Tan et al. disclose cosmetic composition for topical application to skin comprising a first platelet of alumina treated with metal oxide such as iron-oxide, a second platelet for example mica, bismuth oxychloride, alumina, copper, bronze, silver or silica treated with a spherical scattering component. It is also taught that iron oxides as pigments match the color of the skin. It is disclosed that the two platelets together which include first platelet and second platelet match the natural color of the

Art Unit: 1617

skin. Chapman teaches that simple mixtures of bismuth oxychloride with the color pigment but without the binder, calcium stearate generally fail to exhibit the pearlescent qualities of the unpigmented substrate. Accordingly, one of ordinary skill in the art would have been motivated to employ bismuth oxychloride bonded to a colorant with binder, calcium stearate i.e first platelet of Tan is bonded to second platelet bismuth oxychloride with calcium stearate with reasonable expectation of success of obtaining a composition that possess pearlescent qualities of bismuth oxychloride, and with reasonable expectation of success of obtaining a composition which matches the natural color of the skin on bonding bismuth oxychloride with the first platelet as taught by Tan et al.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 11-12, and 27-28 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Tan et al. in view of Chapman as applied to claims 1, 5-10, 13-14, 21-26, and 29 above, in view of Brieva et al. (US 5,800,816, PTO-892 of record).

Tan et al. is as discussed above.

Tan et al. does not teach that the silicone emulsion composition therein comprises isodecane, and the amount of isodecane.

Art Unit: 1617

Breiva et al. discloses a method of making water in silicone emulsion make up composition comprising silicone polymer, cyclomethiocone/dimethicone copolyol; pearlescent ingredient, mica; pigments such as red iron oxide, yellow iron oxide, and water is also disclosed. The composition can comprise from about 0.1-60 % of volatile components which include straight or branched chain hydrocarbons such as isododecane. See column 2, lines 44-46; EXAMPLE 2.

It would have been obvious to a person of ordinary skill in the art at the time of invention to employ isododecane in the compositions of Tan et al. because Breiva teaches analogous silicone emulsion compositions, useful as make up products containing additives such as isododecane.

It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art to employ the specific weight percentages of the isododecane as claimed in the instant invention because it is taught by Breiva that water in silicone emulsion make up composition comprising silicone polymer, cyclomethiocone/dimethicone copolyol; pearlescent ingredient, mica; pigments such as red iron oxide, yellow iron oxide, and water comprise from about 0.1-60 % of volatile components which include straight or branched chain hydrocarbons such as isododecane. Accordingly, Breiva teaches an analogous art comprising the instant isododecane within the amount ranges as claimed in the instant application. One would have been motivated to add isododecane in the weight percentage of the instant application to the composition of Tan et al. because as taught by Breiva, such preparations are useful as make up products.

Art Unit: 1617

It has been held that it is within the skill in the art to select optimal parameters, such as amounts of ingredients, in a composition in order to achieve a beneficial effect. See *In re Boesch*, 205 USPQ 215 (CCPA 1980).

Conclusion

No claims are allowed.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Shobha Kantamneni whose telephone number is 571-272-2930. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday-Friday, 8.00am-4.00pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Sreeni Padmanabhan, Ph.D can be reached on 571-272-0629. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

Shobha Kantamneni, Ph.D
Patent Examiner
Art Unit : 1617

/SREENI PADMANABHAN/

Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art Unit 1617

Application/Control Number: 10/622,299
Art Unit: 1617

Page 9